

PEER REVIEW HISTORY

BMJ Paediatrics Open publishes all reviews undertaken for accepted manuscripts. Reviewers are asked to complete a checklist review form and are provided with free text boxes to elaborate on their assessment. These free text comments are reproduced below.

ARTICLE DETAILS

TITLE (PROVISIONAL)	Resuscitating neonates - 65 years after Virginia Apgar.
AUTHORS	Rüdiger, Mario

VERSION 1 - REVIEW

REVIEWER	Manley, Brett Royal Women's Hospital, Australia Competing interests: None
REVIEW RETURNED	31-Aug-2017

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>The content of the editorial seems appropriate, although without the article it is referring to it is a little hard to comment effectively on the context.</p> <p>There are a few minor grammatical issues to address:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Line 17: Colm O'Donnell (2 'L's) is the correct spelling. Should be Apgar's (with an apostrophe)2. Line 19: 'Stuart' not 'Stewart', and his research should ideally be referenced to his original papers, not to the review article (by me)3. Line 35: Should be 'laryngoscope blades' not just 'blades'4. Line 41: 'worthwhile'; video monitoring (no hyphen)5. Line 42: no comma after 'study'6. Line 44: spelling of 'O'Connel' vs. 'O'Connell' <p>Brett Manley</p>
-------------------------	--

REVIEWER	Knol, Ronny Consultant Neonatologist ErasmusMC - Sophia Children's Hospital Rotterdam, The Netherlands Competing interests: No competing interests
REVIEW RETURNED	15-Sep-2017

GENERAL COMMENTS	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- In my opinion it is a very nice and comprehensive editorial. Congratulations. I did not have access to the original paper of O'Connoll, so I am not aware of their exact results.- I like the title of the editorial and it triggered me. Is it possible to speculate on and to challenge the reader even more on how we have to deal with Apgar scores? Is it still useful or do we have to develop a 'new Apgar-score'?- I think the original article uses video monitoring. Is it possible to include your opinion on the use of video monitoring in the delivery room?- It seems that one conclusion of the original article is that simulation is beneficial. Could you speculate on usefulness of simulation in delivery room management, even for experienced neonatologists?
-------------------------	---

	- One minor remark: I think prof. Hooper's first name is spelled: Stuart.
--	---

VERSION 1 – AUTHOR RESPONSE

Reviewer: 1

There are a few minor grammatical issues to address:

1. Line 17: Colm O'Donnell (2 'L's) is the correct spelling. Should be Apgar's (with an apostrophe) ==> has been changed
2. Line 19: 'Stuart' not 'Stewart', and his research should ideally be referenced to his original papers, not to the review article (by me) ==> I liked your review article, however it has been changed as suggested
3. Line 35: Should be 'laryngoscope blades' not just 'blades' ==> has been changed
4. Line 41: 'worthwhile'; video monitoring (no hyphen) ==> is changed
5. Line 42: no comma after 'study' ==> is deleted
6. Line 44: spelling of 'O'Connel' vs. 'O'Connell' ==> is changed

Reviewer: 2

- In my opinion it is a very nice and comprehensive editorial. Congratulations. ==> thank you very much
- I like the title of the editorial and it triggered me. Is it possible to speculate on and to challenge the reader even more on how we have to deal with Apgar scores? Is it still useful or do we have to develop a 'new Apgar-score'? ==> I hope I have answered your question and would love to go into more detail - however it would not fit to the original article
- I think the original article uses video monitoring. Is it possible to include your opinion on the use of video monitoring in the delivery room? ==> I am really very much in favour of video monitoring, however it was not the primary goal of the original article. THus, I was not able to go into more detail but I agree with you, that this is an excellent topic of a review.
- It seems that one conclusion of the original article is that simulation is beneficial. Could you speculate on usefulness of simulation in delivery room management, even for experienced neonatologists? ==> I have some opinion on stimulation, but only little data. And once again, it was not the topic of the original article. I think Colm has studied stimulation in some more detail.
- One minor remark: I think prof. Hooper's first name is spelled: Stuart.==> is changed