

PEER REVIEW HISTORY

BMJ Paediatrics Open publishes all reviews undertaken for accepted manuscripts. Reviewers are asked to complete a checklist review form and are provided with free text boxes to elaborate on their assessment. These free text comments are reproduced below.

ARTICLE DETAILS

TITLE (PROVISIONAL)	Climate Emergency, Young People and Mental Health: Time for justice and health professional action
AUTHORS	Singh, Guddi Xue, Siqi Poukhovski-Sheremetyev, Feodor

VERSION 1 – REVIEW

REVIEWER	Reviewer name: Dr. Brad Farrant Institution and Country: University of Western Australia Competing interests: none
REVIEW RETURNED	27-Feb-2022

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>Thank you for this timely article. It is well past time that the medical community adopted “a broader conception of health and its determinants” and took a “courageous stance on the topic of climate change” and climate justice by re-examining “its role, and its very purpose, to better address the climate crisis”. The climate crisis is a question of medical justice. Predatory/Extractive capitalism is making the planet and patients sick. The article is well written, and I only have a few fairly minor suggestions for improvement:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Page 4 line 11 – suggest rewording the sentence to – “Climate change is driving a public mental health crisis and young people are among the most at risk groups”2. Page 5 line 39 – perhaps add that the ‘Fridays for Future’ movement is also known as the school climate strike movement3. Suggest that somewhere in the article (perhaps in the A moral community for the 21st century section) that you add a brief exploration of the links between climate justice and medical justice4. Page 11 line 12 – suggest that you add another point regarding the need to write articles, opinion pieces, and letters to the editor for Journals and mainstream print media urging immediate action to prevent dangerous climate change and protect the children and young people of today and tomorrow
-------------------------	--

REVIEWER	Reviewer name: Dr. Tony Waterston Institution and Country: Newcastle University, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland Competing interests: none
REVIEW RETURNED	05-Mar-2022

GENERAL COMMENTS	<p>This paper is valuable in assisting child health practitioners to apply their understanding of the climate emergency to the young person in front of them and to the wider context of the local services and the national setting. I have the following suggestions of how the paper could be improved in areas where there is some lack of clarity or greater opportunity for collaboration.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. in the abstract and introduction, the authors are critical of the medical profession for failing to 'take the next step and act on the evidence'. and that is has a responsibility 'to do more'. I consider that they are over-critical in that elements of the profession have been very active in recent years in publicising the impact of climate change: notably the BMA, RCPCH and RCPsych, together with the
-------------------------	---

	<p>BMJ (which established the Climate and Health Council) and the Lancet with its countdown series. There has also been considerable activism in the profession and this continues. Perhaps the authors refer to clinical action, which is always harder to take in relation to social issues - meaning starting a discussion about climate change with a young person. I would see 'social lens' as meaning that social and environmental factors need to be part of every consultation so perhaps this aspect could be clarified.</p> <p>2. In relation to the Table, I wonder if examples could be used in the different sections.</p> <p>A large part of the problem if eco anxiety is feeling helpless at a time of global calamity. This helplessness can be resolved by taking action but this can be difficult if others are not similarly motivated. Hence the involvement of schools in supporting climate action is critical by establishing eco groups, becoming an eco school, promoting active travel to school, supporting climate strikes and involving children/young people in nature and community projects which tackle climate change. Schools involvement should be mentioned in the local services section.</p> <p>3. a link is given to XR doctors but not to Medact, this should be provided too.</p>
--	--

VERSION 1 – AUTHOR RESPONSE

Dear Editors,

We are extremely grateful for your time and careful attention to our work, and appreciate your advice to help make the article better.

We have accepted all most all suggestions and added them (highlighted on the document). This includes removal of the abstract and replacement with 5 key messages in order to fulfil the criteria of a "Review" article. We feel that the table is more coherent as a single artefact; having asked other colleagues that is the feedback we get from both trainees and more senior colleagues too. As such we have decided to retain the original structure of the table but edited the text where suggestions were made.

On specific points From Reviewer 1:

1. Page 4 line 11 – suggest rewording the sentence to – "Climate change is driving a public mental health crisis and young people are among the most at risk groups"
2. Page 5 line 39 – perhaps add that the 'Fridays for Future' movement is also known as the school climate strike movement
3. Suggest that somewhere in the article (perhaps in the A moral community for the 21st century section) that you add a brief exploration of the links between climate justice and medical justice
4. Page 11 line 12 – suggest that you add another point regarding the need to write articles, opinion pieces, and letters to the editor for Journals and mainstream print media urging immediate action to prevent dangerous climate change and protect the children and young people of today and tomorrow

We have done all of the above

On specific points From Reviewer 2:

1. in the abstract and introduction, the authors are critical of the medical profession for failing to 'take the next step and act on the evidence'. and that is has a responsibility 'to do more'. I consider that they are over-critical in that elements of the profession have been very active in recent years in publicising the impact of climate change: notably the BMA, RCPCH and RCPsych, together with the BMJ (which established the Climate and Health Council) and the Lancet with its countdown series. There has also been considerable activism in the profession and this continues. Perhaps the authors refer to clinical action, which is always harder to take in relation to social issues - meaning starting a discussion about climate change with a young person. I would see 'social lens' as meaning that social and environmental factors need to be part of every consultation so perhaps this aspect could be clarified.
2. In relation to the Table, I wonder if examples could be used in the different sections.

A large part of the problem if eco anxiety is feeling helpless at a time of global calamity. This helplessness can be resolved by taking action but this can be difficult if others are not similarly motivated. Hence the involvement of schools in supporting climate action is critical by establishing eco groups, becoming an eco school, promoting active travel to school, supporting climate strikes and involving children/young people in nature and community projects which tackle climate change. Schools involvement should be mentioned in the local services section.

3. a link is given to XR doctors but not to Medact, this should be provided too.

We have addressed all of the above.

Thank you again for the opportunity to publish our work with you.

All our best wishes,

Dr Guddi Singh

VERSION 2 – REVIEW

REVIEWER	Reviewer name: Institution and Country: Competing interests:
REVIEW RETURNED	

GENERAL COMMENTS	
-------------------------	--

REVIEWER	Reviewer name: Institution and Country: Competing interests:
REVIEW RETURNED	

GENERAL COMMENTS	
-------------------------	--

REVIEWER	Reviewer name: Institution and Country: Competing interests:
REVIEW RETURNED	

GENERAL COMMENTS	
-------------------------	--

VERSION 2 – AUTHOR RESPONSE